57 people voted

**THE MATRIX VOTE – THE RESULTS**

A role-play, hosted by the Institute for Applied Mechanism Design (IFAMD, [http://www.ifamd.org](https://eur06.safelinks.protection.outlook.com/?url=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.ifamd.org%2F&data=04%7C01%7Co.wolleh%40berghof-foundation.org%7Ceeec1e98b5834552f43508d97dccc7f0%7Cf386bc0feec94daa84c2f23819840ebe%7C0%7C0%7C637679140765662134%7CUnknown%7CTWFpbGZsb3d8eyJWIjoiMC4wLjAwMDAiLCJQIjoiV2luMzIiLCJBTiI6Ik1haWwiLCJXVCI6Mn0%3D%7C1000&sdata=znXgIoDLJrqnwiRfmihOzlv9gTRCy4gsfjjC18V%2F9nE%3D&reserved=0) ), the first of this autumn's Adam Smith seminars run by the Centre for Conflict Resolution in Munich, [www.ccr-munich.de/](http://www.ccr-munich.de/) was conducted by the de Borda Institute [www.deborda.org](http://www.deborda.org) on 4.10.2021. It gave the following results, and a full analysis will follow shortly.

Suffice here to say that if the SPD had not split their support for Olaf Scholz between the two ministries of Chancellor and Finance, if instead they had given all their ‘A’ priorities for him to be Chancellor and their ‘B’ priorities for him to be in Finance, then he would indeed have won the Chancellorship.

A second observation relates to AfD and the fact that it topped the QBS poll. If any of the other parties (apart from Der Linke which had only three MPs in the mini-Bundestag) had decided that such an eventuality was undesirable, they could easily have put themselves ahead of AfD. That said, nearly every party – SPD, CDU, GP and Der Linke – gave their support for Lars Klingbeil to become the Minister of Justice, so to ensure that the AfD could not possibly get that Ministry! And the AfD finished with that which everyone considered to be the least important post, the Food Ministry.

In summary, the outcome was a power-sharing Cabinet, with the SPD having 4 Ministers, the CDU 5, GP 3, FDP 2, AfD 1 and Der Linke 0. Top of the (matrix) poll was Robert Habeck for Environment! There was also a consensus for the AfD to be given that which the ‘Parties’ considered to be the least important post, the Ministry of Food. The results are shown below.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **THE CABINET**  Names of candidates in  order of preference | | |  | | |  | **MINISTERS** | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | MBC  Scores  and  analysis | |
| Chancellor | Environment | Finance | Development | Education | Justice | Economy | Defence | Foreign Affairs | Interior | Labour | Transport | Special Tasks | Health | Food |
| QBS analysis | | Party | | 1st prefs  quotas | 1st/2ndprefs  quotas | |
| **1st** | Alice Weidel | **AfD** | | **1.5** |  | |  |  |  |  |  | **90** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 90 | 15th |
| **2nd** | Robert Habeck | **GP** | | **1.25** | **2.25** | |  | **601** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 631 | 1st |
| **9th** | Anna Baerbock | **GP** | | **1** |  | **24** |  |  | **290** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 314 | 9th |
| **3rd** | Olaf Scholz | **SPD** | | **1** | **2** | | **339** |  | **220** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 559 | 2nd |
| 7th | Saskia Esken | **SPD** | | **1** |  |  | **288** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | **32** |  | 320 | 8th |
| **4th** | Lars Klingbeil | **SPD** | | **1** |  | |  |  |  |  |  | **411** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 420 | 4th |
| **5th** | Markus Söder | **CDU** | | **1** |  | | **343** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | **16** |  |  | 359 | 7th |
| **6th** | Ye-One Rhie | **SPD** | | **1** |  | |  |  |  | **314** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | **48** |  |  | 362 | 6th |
| **8th** | Christian Linder | **FDP** | | **1** |  | |  |  | **48** |  |  |  | **420** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 468 | 3rd |
| **10th** | Peter Altmaier | **CDU** | | **1** |  | |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | **240** | **64** |  |  |  |  | 304 | 10th |
| **11th** | Dorothy Bár | **CDU** | | **1** |  | |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | **212** | **9** |  |  | 221 | 13th |
| **12th** | Anton Hofreiter | **GP** | |  |  | |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | **357** |  |  |  |  |  | **27** | 384 | 5th |
| **13th** | Ralph Brinkhaus | **CDU** | |  |  | |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | **269** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 269 | 11th |
| **14th** | Yvonne Magwas | **CDU** | |  |  | |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | **176** |  |  |  | **80** | 256 | 12th |
| **15th** | Linda Teuteberg | **FDP** | |  |  | |  |  | **18** | **153** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | **32** |  | 203 | 14th |
| **MBC scores** | | | | | |  | **760** | **625** | **622** | **605** | **544** | **534** | **492** | **450** | **420** | **390** | **390** | **347** | **187** | **165** | **124** | 6840  6655 | |

57 people voted, and all of them cast 15 preferences (although a few did not specify a Ministry for some of their lower preferences). A full ballot of 15 preferences exercises a total of (15 + 14 + … + 1 =) 120 points; and 57 x 120 = 6840 (as in the bottom right=hand corner).

The above table shows, in the shaded left-hand column, the candidates in descending order of QBS popularity (with just Anna Baerbock and Saskia Esken) out of scew, because they were in pairs with Robert Habeck and Olaf Scholz respectively. First, then, those with the highest number of 1st preferences – and there were 11 of those. There were some pairs, but both members of both pairs were already elected. And the last four members of Cabinet were thoswe with the highest MBC scores (as in the right-hand column). The MBC analysis of the points in the matrix is shown overleaf.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **THE CABINET**  Names of candidates in  order of preference | | | | | **MINISTERS** | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | MBC  Scores  and  analysis | |
| **Chancellor** | Environment | Finance | Development | Education | Justice | Economy | Defence | Foreign Affairs | Interior | Labour | Transport | Special Tasks | Health | Food |
| QBS analysis | | Party | 1st  prefs  quotas | 1st/2nd  prefs  quotas |
| **1st** | Alice Weidel | **AfD** | **1.5** |  |  |  |  |  |  | **90** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | **0** | 90 | 15th |
| **2nd** | Robert Habeck | **GP** | **1.25** | **2.25** |  | **601** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 631 | 1st |
| **9th** | Anna Baerbock | **GP** | **1** |  | **24** |  |  | **290** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 314 | 9th |
| **3rd** | Olaf Scholz | **SPD** | **1** | **2** | **339** |  | **220** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | **0** |  |  | 559 | 2nd |
| 7th | Saskia Esken | **SPD** | **1** |  |  | **288** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | **32** |  | 320 | 8th |
| **4th** | Lars Klingbeil | **SPD** | **1** |  |  |  |  |  |  | **411** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 420 | 4th |
| **5th** | Markus Söder | **CDU** | **1** |  | **343** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | **16** |  |  | 359 | 7th |
| **6th** | Ye-One Rhie | **SPD** | **1** |  |  |  |  | **314** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | **48** |  |  | 362 | 6th |
| **8th** | Christian Linder | **FDP** | **1** |  |  |  | **48** |  |  |  | **420** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 468 | 3rd |
| **10th** | Peter Altmaier | **CDU** | **1** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | **240** | **64** |  |  |  |  | 304 | 10th |
| **11th** | Dorothy Bár | **CDU** | **1** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | **212** | **9** |  |  | 221 | 13th |
| **12th** | Anton Hofreiter | **GP** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | **357** |  |  |  |  |  | **27** | 384 | 5th |
| **13th** | Ralph Brinkhaus | **CDU** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | **269** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 269 | 11th |
| **14th** | Yvonne Magwas | **CDU** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | **176** |  |  |  | **80** | 256 | 12th |
| **15th** | Linda Teuteberg | **FDP** |  |  |  |  | **18** | **153** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | **32** |  | 203 | 14th |
| **MBC scores** | | | | | **760** | **625** | **622** | **605** | **544** | **534** | **492** | **450** | **420** | **390** | **390** | **347** | **187** | **165** | **124** | 6840  6655 | |

The appointment of ministers is based on an MBC analysis of the sums in the matrix. The biggest sum, 601 (green) gives Robert Habeck the Environment, and any other sums in his row or column, like the 24 for Anna Baerbock, now become redundant. Next, 420, appoints Christian Linder to Economy; and 411 puts Lars Klingbeil into Justice. 357 sees another GP success, as Anton Hofreiter takes on Foreign Affairs.

Now comes some contention, in the appointment of the Chancellor. Markus Söder gets 343 points which is more than Olaf Scholz, so the CDU gets the job, and Olaf Scholz’s 339 is redundant. (For reasons unknown, the SPD did not give him any ‘B’ priorities.) This is followed by 314, 290, and 288, to give, respectively, Ye-One Rhie Development, Annalena Baerbock Education, and Saskia Esken Finance. And yet again, with no ‘B’ priorities, Olaf Scholz loses by a narrow margin. 269, 240, 212 and 176 are next, so Ralph Brinkhaus Defence, Peter Altmaier Interior, Dorothy Bár Transport and Yvonne Magwas Labour.

The highest number still to be reckoned with (i.e., which has not been rendered redundant) is 32, putting Linda Teuteberg in Health. Finally, with two ministries still to be filled and two appointments still to be made, the more popular candidate, Olaf Scholz goes to the higher scorer Special Tasks, and Alice Weidel of the AfD is given Food.

That’s it. A more detailed analysis will follow shortly.

Charles Stanley-Smith

Peter Emerson

6.10.2021